ETHICS OF ALTERITY AND CORPOREAL PNEUMATOLOGY FOR A CLIMATE-STRICKEN WORLD

Jojo M. Fung, SJ

The current viral pandemic and climate crises are global menaces. Life as we know it has been ruptured by the resurgence of the contagious Omicron BA.5, the newest subvariant of the COVID19 omicron variant, besides the Alpha (Q lineages) and Gamma (P.1 lineages) variants, that has claimed almost 5 million lives globally. With recurrent droughts, fires and floods, earthquakes and volcanic eruptions, glacial melting, rising sea levels and the earth's temperature, climate changes are becoming commonplace. Global growth, impeded by uneven vaccination, is expected to accelerate to 5.6% in 2021, as major economies like the United States and China bounce back. But the level of global GDP in 2021 is expected to be 3.2% below pre-pandemic projections. The per capita GDP among many emerging markets and developing economies is anticipated to accelerate to 6% in 2021 and drop to 4.7 % in 2022. This impending trend is occasioned by the erosion of skills from lost work and schooling, a sharp fall in investment, higher debt burdens, and greater financial vulnerability.[1] In relation to global climate-scape, Patricia Espinosa, Executive Secretary of UN Climate Change, warned of climate emergency in terms of "the devastating loss of lives and livelihoods this year [2021] due to extreme weather events" as the earth is "on track for a global temperature rise of 2.7 °C, while we should be heading

[1]"The Global Economy: on Track for Strong but Uneven Growth as COVID-19 Still Weighs," June 8, 2021, https://www.worldbank.org/en/news/feature/2021/06/08/the-global-economy-on-track-for-strong-but-uneven-growth-as-covid-19-still-weighs.

https://publications.lst.edu/

for the 1.5 °C goal," unless the world leaders make deep cuts to CO_2 and other greenhouse gas emissions by 2050 or 2060.[2]

The global climate and viral menace have posed an unprecedented challenge to the capitalistic rationality that has failed to forge a tangible cohesion among nations of EU, G7 and G20 with their manifest xenophobic ethnocentricity and geopolitical "breach of trust" between developed and vulnerable nations. Since 2014, most EU countries have closed their borders to an estimated 200,000 refugees and migrants who fled across the Mediterranean Sea to Europe for safety, turning the sea into a mass graveyard. The US, under the Trump Administration, has tightened immigration restrictions, ended the Obama-era protections for unauthorized immigrants, and proposed the construction of a border wall to halt the inflow of Latin American refugees and migrants since 2017. With the UN Framework Convention on Climate Change (COP27) to be held in Egypt this October and COP15 in Canada this November 2022, climate financing and decarbonization, after the Paris Agreement, has become all the more urgent.[3]

This Western subjectivity and rationality as the *modus operandi* of managing a "closed society" and determining the

[2]UN Climate Press Release, "Greater Ambition Now Critical" as UN Climate Change Conference Opens," October 31, 2021, https://unfccc.int/news/greater-ambition-now-critical-as-un-climate-change-conference-opens; IPCC Report, "Climate Change 2021: The Physical Science Basis," (2021), https://www.ipcc.ch/report/ar6/wg1/downloads/report/IPCC_AR6_WGI_Full_Report.pdf.

[3]The UN Climate Change Executive Secretary, Patricia Espinosa, has called on the developed countries to honor their pledges to mobilize US$100 billion annually, up by US$1.3 trillion in the year 2030, for the long-term climate funds after the Paris Agreement to support the decarbonization efforts of the low-middle-income nations. See "UN Climate Chief Urges Countries to Deliver on USD 100 Billion Pledge," June 7, 2021, https://unfccc.int/news/un-climate-chief-urges-countries-to-deliver-on-usd-100-billion-pledge; David Ljunggren, "Developed nations to deliver climate fund 3 years late, hope to rebuild trust," October 25, 2021, https://www.reuters.com/article/us-climate-un-funds-idAFKBN2HF19T.

https://publications.lst.edu/

climate financing of the nations of the global South have to be critiqued in the light of a reimagined Levinasian ethics of alterity in section two. The Levinasian ethics alterity has to be grounded in a corporeal pneumatology that explains the inspirational role of *Rûah Elohim* that offers the ethics of alterity with a pneumatic dynamism will be dealt with in section three. The last section will explain the discernible signs of *Rûah*'s creativity in the multiple "alterity-shifts" occasioned by the vulnerabilities of our fellow humankind, otherkinds, and the wounded earth in the transitional process to the post-pandemic-COP27-15 (PPC) world.

Reimagining Levinasian Ethics of Alterity

Bearing in mind Levinas' aforesaid dictum that "history is worked over by the ruptures of history, in which a judgment is borne upon it," the current disruptive pandemic and climate crises have subjected Western subjectivity, mired in military, technological and geopolitical rivalry, and its virulent effects on the poor and the earth to a historic scrutiny through the lens of a Levinasian ethics of alterity.[4]

[4]To gain an overview of Emmanuel Levinas' scholarly thoughts and philosophical thoughts that led to the articulation of his ethics of alterity, see Stanford Encyclopedia on Philosophy, 'Emmanuel Levinas,' July 23, 2006, https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/levinas/; Bergo, Bettina, "Emmanuel Levinas," *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (Summer 2015 Edition), Edward N. Zalta (ed.), https://plato.stanford.edui/archives/sum2015/entries/levinas/; Matthew Eaton, "An-Archy and Awakening: The Ethical and Political Temporalities of Christology and Pneumatology," *The Heythrop Journal: A Bimonthly Review of Philosophy and Theology*, 60 (2019): 624-641. On the rupture of history, see Emmanuel Levinas, *Totality and Infinity: An Essay on Exteriority*, Alphonso Lingis (trans.), Pittsburgh: Duquesne University Press, 1969. The Western subjectivity has become the Westernized subjectivity of the oligarchy in league with the business elites of every conceivable nation whose alter ego/psyche/mindset is manifestly myopic, self-indulgent, at times, narcissistic, but hegemonic and xenophobic towards the vulnerable other who are our fellow humans and the wounded Earth.

Foremost, the Levinasian ethics of alterity calls for the unleashing of Western subjectivity from its self-indulgent ethnocentricity and tyrannical anthropocentricity in order to return to an experiential and authentic encounter with the migrants and the wounded earth at the level of pre-intentional embodied sensitivity that is denoted by *arche* (beginning/origin). *Arche* is "an archic time" that privileges a level of embodied experience prior to both reflective activity and practical interests that is infinite and, therefore, beyond the phenomenological temporality of finite cognitive interpretation, dogmatic thematicization, and representational analogy. This an-archic time facilitates the awakening of an I, endowed with sovereign power "that gives birth to worlds of language, cognition, and subjectivity."[5] An archic time, Levinas averred, is prior to the finite temporality of a thinking subject which is locked within the basic temporal framework in which "the subject is enchained to itself, unable to embrace the alterity of another *kath'auto*."[6] Entrapped in this finite temporality, the self-possessed subject silences and erases the self-expression of alterity, constituting a violent interruption of ethics.

Once unchained, the eruption of ethics occurs, especially with "an authentic revelation of and relation with another person" within "the an-archy of affective face-to-face encounter of alterity in the depths of its own self-expression by itself (*kath'auto*)" that Levinas called the "face" that is experienced

[5]For Pre-Socratic natural philosophers on Archy as the beginning, source, or sovereign power from which the world emerged, see Karl Popper, *The World of Parmenides: Essays on the Presocratic Enlightenment* (London, UK: Routledge, 1998); James Warren, *Presocratics* (Stocksfield, Uk: Acumen, 2007).

[6]The Greek *kath'auto* is interpreted as 'in itself'. See Levinas, *Totality and Infinity,* 78.

https://publications.lst.edu/

in its nudity.[7] Levinas painstakingly emphasized that "the nakedness of the "face" is not what is presented to me because I disclosed it, what would therefore be presented to me, to my powers, to my eyes, to my perceptions, in a light exterior to it."[8] Alterity is only possible when "the face has turned to me – and this is its very nudity. It *is* by itself and not by reference to a system."[9] Furthermore, the experience of alterity, while it is cognitive, is "beyond quantification, calculation, and observation," allowing an-archy of another to be present and take up residence as "an incision made in time... a visitation and a coming."[10]

In an-archic time, the embodied sensitivity of the awakened I in the "close society" experiences multiple affects – anger, illusion, frustration, haplessness, empathy, and solidarity, in an encounter of intersubjective nudity. Most poignant, Levinas' opined, is "the eruption of affect into the present time of the subject is experienced as a 'trace' – i.e., the reverberation of an-archy into the subjective present time of the subject as a ghostly, non-phenomenal revenant who haunts the subject through the moods and feelings that travel from one time to another, summoning subjects to take responsibility for a

[7]Levinas, *Otherwise than Being or Beyond Essence*, trans. Alphonso Lingis (Pittsburg, PA: Duquesne University Press, 1998), 99-129; 'Humanism and An-archy' in *Collected Philosophical Papers*, trans. Alphonso Lingis (Dondrecht, NL: Nijhoff, 1987), 127-39; 'Philosophy and the Idea of Infinity,' in *Collected Philosophical Papers*, trans. Alphonso Lingis (Dondrecht, NL: Nijhoff, 1987), 65-66.

[8]Levinas, 'Philosophy and the Idea of Infinity,' 74.

[9]Ibid.

[10]Levinas, 'Phenomenon and Enigma,' in *Collected Philosophical Papers*, trans. Alphonso Lingis (Dondrecht, NL: Nijhoff, 1987), 61-73; 'The Trace of the Other,' trans. Alphonso Lingis in Mark Taylor, ed., *Deconstruction in Context* (Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 1986), 345-59, at 354.

vulnerability encountered."[11] Levinas further explained the "trace" as "what is left over from a fully material encounter, carried bodily into the subjective present; it is a disincarnate, though sensuous, an echo whose fullness lies in another time, but now resides within the present."[12]

A return to this an *archic* encounter of intersubjective nudity transforms the existent subjectivity in our globalized temporality to embrace the marginal humans, otherkinds, and the earth in their *illeity*. The alterity of the "face" of the other is "always a threesome: I and you, and the Third who is in our midst," who is always entangled with the "face" of the vulnerable other– a jobless migrant worker, a refugee in the border camp, a carbonized atmosphere and a plastic-polluted ocean, all inextricably entangled within the face/body of the marginal-vulnerable other.[13] The "face" is the marginal-vulnerable other, beyond the you, described by Levinas as "the *illeity* of the other – the *il* or the *elle*, the he, she, or otherwise beyond the 'you' met in the present" and "the *illeity* of the other is the other as such, the one who expresses an-archically through affect within the face-to-face relationship."[14] The marginal other, in her/his *illeity*, "is an irreducible, transcendent singularity, the infinite expression from which the idea of God becomes

[11]Ibid.

[12]Levinas, *Totality and Infinity,* trans. Alphonso Lingis (Pittsburg, PA: Duquesne University Press, 2013), 220-47; Robert Gibbs, "The Disincarnation of the Word: The Trace of God in Reading Scripture," in Kevin Hart and Michael Alan Signer, eds. *The Exorbitant: Emmanuel Levinas between Jews and Christians* (New York, NY: Fordham University Press, 2010), 32-51.

[13]Levinas, "Ideology and idealism: in Sean Hand, ed. *The Levinas Reader* (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1089), 235-248 & "The Ego and Totality,' *in Collected Philosophical Papers*, trans. Alphonso Lingus (Dordrecht, NL: Nijhoff, 1986), 25-46.

[14]Levinas, "Phenomenon and Enigma," 72.

https://publications.lst.edu/

possible, awakens, and comes to mind."[15] For Levinas, "*Illeity* is itself divine. God [and] is not a subject mediated through the face of another; God is entangled within, even if irreducible to, the face of another."[16]

To a certain extent, the viral disruption is a *kairos* for envisioning a PPC world beyond the financialization of the earth's human and non-renewable resources through "resource extraction, labor exploitation, capital accumulation, and what is known as "ecocide"." [17] More fundamentally, this rupture disposes the awakened to an archy when the subject is "without clothing, without a shell to protect oneself, stripped to the core as in an inspiration of air, an ab-solution to the *one*, the one without complexion, [because] it is a denuding beyond the skin to the sounds one dies from, denuding to death, being as vulnerability."[18] It is a nudity of vulnerable bodies exposed to the agony of a violated earth, agonizing over the erratic climate changes, rising sea levels and the earth's temperature, the zoogenic illnesses due to deforestation that drastically reduced the natural habitats of animals, causing viral pandemic and death. For Levinas, awakening is "putting the Infinite into thought, but this is wholly different from what is structured as a comprehension of a *cogitatum* by a *cogitation*."[19] In the an-archic time, the awakened subjects experience freedom from their enchainment to the indulgent-xenophobic-anthropocentric self, imprisoned in the mass fear and hysteria of an

[15]Levinas, *Totality and Infinity*, 77-9.

[16]Ibid.

[17]Kathleen Kesson, "Three Scenarios for the Future of Education in the Anthropocene," April 12, 2020, jfsdigital.org/2020/04/12/three-scenarios-for-the-future-of-education-in-the-anthropocene/.

[18]Levinas, "Language and Proximity," 116.

[19]Levinas, "God and Philosophy," in *Collected Philosophical Papers,* vol 100. Springer, Dordrecht, 1987.

afflicted world and carbonized earth.[20] Upon awakening, the liberated subjects whose bodies have been impacted by the multiple effects of a pre-original event, choose how to react to their emergent feelings - either to joyfully welcome the other with hospitality or deny/erase the summons of alterity. A disruption of the eruption of the ethics of alterity will relinquish all the vulnerable kinds and the earth to untold human suffering due to overexposure to the "geno-ecocidal toxicity" of a violated earth. The experience of ethical alterity interrogates the sovereignty of the self-indulgent, xenophobic, and anthropocentric West in its hegemonic exercise of geopolitical aggressivity.[21] This other-directed alterity motivates the apathetic populace to become awakened subjects who mount an "uncompromising resistance" to such tyrannical xenophobia and anthropocentrism,[22] exemplified by Pope Francis in his unflinching resistance to the "closed society" in Europe in stating that "being a migrant is not a crime but summons to greater commitment on behalf of the dignity of every human being" and "future generations will never forgive us if we miss the opportunity to protect our common home. We have inherited a garden; we must not leave a desert for our children."[23]

---

[20]Ibid.

[21]In addition to the Five Eyes (1941), the recent formation of QUADS (2017) and AUKUS (2021) are regarded by some critics as typical of the hegemonic geopolitical aggressivity of the US and its allies.

[22]Levinas, "The Trace of the Other," 352; *Otherwise than Being or Beyond Essence*, 122-23.

[23]"Pope Francis' vision for the refounding of Europe: text of Charlemagne Speech Award address," May 6, 2016, https://www.catholicvoices.org.uk/blog/2016/05/06/pope-francis-vision-for-the-refounding-of-europe-text-of-charlemagne-speech-award-address; Jonathon Braden, "Pope Francis, faith leaders sign joint appeal before UN climate summit," (Rome, Oct 4, 2021), https://laudatosi-movement.org/2021/10/04/pope-francis-faith-leaders-sign-joint-appeal-before-un-climate-summit/.

https://publications.lst.edu/

The unchaining of the awakened self through the Levinasian archic face-to-face encounter and the subsequent respons-*ability* facilitates the fulfillment of justice in the embrace of the *illeity* of the vulnerable other and the wounded Earth. As an incarnated *Rûah*, God is now corporealized in the vulnerable neighbors and the violated earth. The corporealized *Rûah* becomes the inner dynamism that facilitates such a personal *encounter with* and *experience of* the Divine in the vulnerable poor and the wounded Earth. Hence, this reimagined Levinasian ethics of alterity has to be supplemented with a pneumatic orientation grounded in a corporeal pneumatology that emanates from the corporeal trinitarian theology of Mark I. Wallace and Matthew Eaton.

In-spirational Role of *Rûah Elohim*

The pre-existent *Rûah Elohim*, Mark I. Wallace posits, "breathes the world into existence and therefore enfleshes herself in the creation and maintenance of the natural order."[24] For Wallace, this pneumatic creation of the world, is entangled with "the trinitarian enfleshment of God in nature," which Wallace envisions as "a tripartite movement,", marked by the sequential corporealization of God, Jesus, and *Rûah Elohim*, at different epochal times of creation.[25] Hence, in Wallace's sequence, the corporealization of the Spirit begins "after the work of the Son, revealing God, and co-creating and redeeming creaturely life through ethics."[26] *Rûah Elohim*, Wallace postulates, is not only the power of *koinonia* in the triune God, but the *Rûah* "between God and the whole creation as well."[27] Wallace

[24]Mark I. Wallace, "The Green Face of God: Christianity in an Age of Ecocide," *Cross Currents* 50 (Fall 2000): 318.

[25]Ibid.

[26]Ibid.

[27]Ibid., 317.

believes that *Rûah Elohim* is continuing the in-spirational co-creativity of the God who "as Trinity subsists in interpersonal unity through incarnating itself in all things that swim, creep, crawl, run, fly, and grow upon the earth."[28] This corporealization of *Rûah Elohim*, Wallace adds, "is consistent with the scriptural portrayal of the Spirit as a revolutionary force who labors to invert the established social order."[29]

In Matthew Eaton's postulation, *Rûah Elohim* continues "the in-spirational work of redemptive co-creativity, awakens the subject as the trace of the other within the same, guiding the subject into her or his responsibility to seek the justice and the common good within a plurality of political ecologies" and thus promotes "justice to the vulnerable, reconciliation to enemies, healing to the divisions that break unity, and a communion of love insofar as this is possible."[30] On the other hand, Wallace believes "the Son perpetually births the Spirit of God as the other in the same, who works for a sustainable peace within Earth's more-than-human communities in this cocreativity of redemption."[31] This co-creative redemption of the Son and *Rûah Elohim* is a relational koinonia, so much so that "the Spirit is the cruciform and political awakening of the Son's an-archy" and "together, the Son and the Spirit labor for peace within the socio-political realm by reconciling difference, demanding justice, and calling the violence of sovereignty into question."[32]

As Wallace notes, the Spirit can be said to assume "a creaturely lifeform always already interpenetrated by the material

[28]Ibid., 318.

[29]Ibid., "The Wild Bird Who Heals," *Theology Today* 50, 1(1993): 19.

[30]Eaton, "An-Archy and Awakening," 631, 633.

[31]Wallace, "The Green Face of God," 318.

[32]Ibid.

https://publications.lst.edu/

world."[33] This means, Eaton opines, "the Spirit *is* in nature as its interanimating force, as important as that is, but that Spirit *is* a natural being who leads all creation into a peaceable relationship with itself."[34] And both *Rûah Elohim* and the cosmos "internally condition and permeate one another without collapsing into undifferentiated sameness or equivalence."[35] In this interpenetration, God, who is *Rûah Elohim,* and the cosmos are, in Leonardo Boff's opinion, "perichoretically involved in one another" so that "everything that happens in the world somehow affects God, and everything that happens in God somehow affects the world."[36] In Eaton's postulation, both *Rûah Elohim* and the cosmos "internally condition and permeate one another without collapsing into undifferentiated sameness or equivalence" for God is not identical with the cosmos, nor is the cosmos identified as God.[37] In this perchoretic process, the triune God, who is *Rûah Elohim,* has radically corporealized in the Cosmos-Earth as to be pervasively manifested in everything that moves and exists in the Cosmos-Earth.

[33]Mark I. Wallace, "Christian Animism, Green Spirit Theology, and the Global Hope in an Age of Radical Ecology," in Deiter T. Hessel and Rosemary Raford Ruether, eds. *Christianity and Ecology: Seeking the Well-Being of Earth and Humans* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2000), 51-72.

[34]Cited in Eaton, "An-Archy and Awakening," 633.

[35]Wallace, "The Wild Birds who heals," 15.

[36]Leonard Boff, *Cry of the Earth, Cry of the Poor,* trans. Philip Berryman (New York: Orbis Books, 1995), 159, 169. Also see Reynaldo D. Raluto, *Poverty and Ecology at the Crossroads: Towards an Ecological Theology of Liberation in the Philippine Context* (Manila: Ateneo de Manila University Press, 2015), 133.

[37]Eaton, "An-Archy and Awakening," 633.

The age of "Anthropocene"[38] has not fully eclipsed the age of *Rûah Elohim* or the era called the "Pneumatolocene" which witnesses the inspirational cocreativity of the *Rûah* of the triune God. This God is corporealized in the Cosmos and the planet Earth and all humankind and otherkinds. All created things are "Divine expression, be it the Son's or the Spirit's, is neither disembodied nor phantasmal; it burns and shivers in the face of all the vulnerable kinds and the disfigured earth that call the power of sovereign violence into question."[39] Now all created kinds and the earth are "bearers of the sacred; everything that is, is holy; each and every creature is a portrait of God."[40] But the shivering bodies must now include the wounded Earth, wailing due to deforestation, the toxification of the air, soil, and water, the cataclysmic climate changes, the melting of glacial ice, the rising of the sea, the submergence of the islands and coasts, the increase of the earth's temperature to 2.7°C. Ultimately, corporeal pneumatology alerts us that the Cosmos-Earth is shot through with the co-creativity of *Rûah Elohim,* "including the dust-we-are, is saved, transfigured, spiritualized because of its relationship with God in Christ through the incarnation and consummation in the final commonwealth. All as the work of the Holy Spirit," asserts Robert D. Hughes.[41]

---

[38]Paul Crutzen opines that the Anthropocene "refers to the geological epoch shaped by human activities since the early Industrial Revolution,' perhaps even earlier, in which 'humans have become such a dominant force that they co-determine the state of the earth's crust" for the first time in world history. See Paul J. Crutzen and E. F. Stoermer, "The 'Anthropocene,'" *International Geosphere-Biosphere Programme Newsletter* 41 (2000): 17-18.

[39]Wallace, "Christian animism, Green Spirit Theology, and the Global Crisis Today," 221.

[40]Ibid.

[41]Robert Davies Hughes, III, *Beloved Dust: Tides of the Spirit in Christian Life* (New York & London: Continuum, 2008), 274.

https://publications.lst.edu/

This corporeal pneumatology is the basis for positing that *Rûah Elohim* is the pneumatic dynamism in the Levinasian ethics of alterity as *Rûah Elohim* awakens the subjects after the intersubjective *encounter with* and *kenotic embrace of* the nudity of the vulnerable other, and enables them to respond to the cries of the marginal-vulnerable neighbor and the ruptured earth. The inspirational co-creativity of *Rûah Elohim* in all awakened subjects is manifested in discernible signs in current globalscape in the gradual emanation of a more sustainable PPC world.

Rûah's Co-creativity in a PPC World

Rûah Elohim's inspirational creative power is actively present in the concerted and collaborative agency of the awakened subjects. Such pneumatic co-creativity is manifested in at least five discernible "alterity-shifts" in the emergent process of a PPC world, ranging from an alterity driven by sophia, the nascent public values, visibilized in sacrificial services, climate financing and strategic political actions in our globalscape.

1. *Alterity driven by Sophia/wisdom.* The current global rupture has indicated the untenability of the androcentric-positivistic rationality, which has occasioned a discernible shift to (re) value biblical and religiocultural wisdom. As *Sophia* is equated with *Rûah Elohim* in the Hebrew scriptures, *Rûah Elohim* is the Spirit-power that pervades all of creation. Hence, Gerhard von Rad believed that "life wisdom" is not differentiated from "nature wisdom."[42] In this vein, the awakened subjects have arguably much to learn from the revelatory nature of the poor but more so from the earth and creation (Wis. of Sol. 13:1). This means the ants, locusts, lizards, badgers (Pro. 30:24-28), beasts, birds, reptiles and creatures (James 3:7) have much to teach

[42]Gerhard von Rad, *Wisdom in Israel* (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1972), 71.

humans about "life-nature-wisdom". The ancestral wisdom of Native American religious life manifests, Kenneth Morrison contends, "power [that] is always conceived as a gift that forges solidarity" between humankind and otherkinds.[43] This gift of the power of interbeing solidarity is grounded in the ancestral wisdom of the indigenous wo/men elders, healers, mystics, and shamans. A case in point is the wisdom of the Lakota Sioux nations that pronounces such interbeing solidarity as "*All Are Related*" or "*Mitákuye Oyás'iŋ.*"[44] For this reason, Anthony Iannarino is correct in advocating that "Knowledge Is Not Power – Wisdom Is Power."[45] Furthermore, Elisabeth Schüssler Fiorenza posits that wisdom is a capability that refers to "the quality of life and of people" and, at the same time, a "female personification," depicted as a spiraling presence (*Shekhinah*) that is "global, embracing all creation," much akin to a "spiraling circle dance of wisdom/Wisdom," driving "a Spirit/

[43]Kenneth Morrison, "The Cosmos as Intersubjective: Native American Other Than-Human Persons", in Indigenous Religions: A Companion, ed. by Graham Harvey (New York: Cassell, 2000), 85.

[44]"Mitákuye Oyás'iŋ translates as "All Are Related" in the Lakota language. This wisdom-saying reflects the worldview-feel of interconnectedness experienced by the Lakota people in many Yankton Sioux prayers, as well as by ceremonial people in other Lakota communities in North America.

[45]Anthony Iannarino, "Knowledge Is Not Power – Wisdom Is Power," March 24, 2010, http://www.thesalesblog.com/blog/knowledge-is-not-power-wisdom-is-power.

https://publications.lst.edu/

spiritual intellectual movement in the open space of wisdom/Wisdom" who inspires justice-seeking earth sojourners."[46]

2. Nascent Public Values. The co-creativity of Rûah Elohim is discernible in the gradual shift in the global "econo-scape" that Paul Carney, the former governor of the Bank of England, perceived. It is an observable shift from "a market economy to a market society" to the extent that "the price of everything is becoming the value of everything."[47] What is needed in the PPC world, Carney adds, is "public values [that] help shape private values," prioritizing "health first ... and then looked to deal with economic consequences...[and] we need to act as an interdependent community not independent individuals," so that "the values of economic dynamism and efficiency have been joined by those of solidarity, fairness, responsibility and compassion," responsibility and compassion, sacred communion with Mother Earth, heartfelt gratitude to the boundless divine gratuitousness.[48] To this cluster of public values must be added

[46]Elisabeth Schüssler Fiorenza, "Come Eat of My Bread . . . and Walk in the Ways of Wisdom," Foreword, Elisabeth Editor's Introduction to Wisdom," in Antoinette Clark Wire, Mary Ann Beavis, Barbara E. Reid, 2 Corinthians, WISDOM COMMENTARY, Vol. 48 (Collegeville, Minnesota: Liturgical Press, 2002), xxiii-xxv, at xix, xxiii; https://books.google.com.ph/books?id=di45DwAAQBAJ&pg=PR7&lpg=PR7&dq=Elisabeth+Sch%C3%BCssler+Fiorenza,+%E2%80%9CCome+Eat+of+My+Bread+.+.+.+and+Walk+in+the+Ways+of+Wisdom,%E2 %80%9D+Foreword, +Elisabeth+Editor %E2%80%99s+Introduction +to+Wisdom,%E2%80%9D&source=bl&ots=i DAuyIP_lc&sig=ACfU3U2O bxDeUHfEfPlf82PCpdLYF cge4g&hl=en&sa=X&ved=2ahUKEwiVpOaF1vbzAh UHy4sBHW0lCpcQ6AF6BAgQEAM#v=onepage&q=Elisabeth%20Sch%C3%BCssler%20Fiorenza%2C%20%E2%80%9CCome%20Eat%20of%20My%20Bread%20.%20.%20.%20and%20Walk%20in%20the%20Ways%20of%20Wisdom%2C%E2%80%9D%20Foreword%2C%20Elisabeth%20Editor%E2%80%99s%20Introduction%20to%20Wisdom%2C%E2%80%9D&f=false.

[47]Paul Carney, "Putting Values above Valuations," *The Economist* (April 2020): 64.

[48]Ibid.

planetary fitness that prioritizes a planned global practice of circular economy, sustainable lifestyle, persistent reforestation coupled with deforestation by 2030, de-financialization of earth's fossil fuels, and resolute decarbonization of the global society through the use of electric vehicles, solar, thermal gas and wind energies.[49] After all, Carney contends, "our ambitions should be bolder – nothing less than to make a fit planet for our grandchildren,", otherkinds, and the Earth to survive sustainably in the PPC world.[50]

3. *Alerity visibilized through Sacrificial Services.* The awakened subjects, inspired by a Spirit-driven alterity, offer sacrificial services that embrace the denuded self of the vulnerable other. These sacrificial services are emblematized in the ordinarily invisible and often scorned service professions - the cleaners, day laborers, small traders, rubbish collectors, delivery drivers, mail carriers, supermarket employees, police, social workers, public transport staff, pharmacists, soldiers, teachers, funeral workers, and relief-aid workers at the refugee camps. This further includes the frontline doctors, nurses, and healthcare-givers, though ill-equipped, vicariously embrace the vulnerable nudity of the infected whose lives hang in the balance, supported by the ventilators. Many of the doctors and nurses are infected and some perished in this kenotic service. Those emergency workers also embody the sacrificial service in the relief shelters and cramped refugee camps, where vulnerable bodies are fatally exposed to the double threats of infection and hunger. Such sacrificial services signify the cocreativity of Rûah Elohim in infusing passion and vitality into the emanation of a PPC world.

[49]"Planetary Fitness: Falling Emissions should be maintained as countries recover," *The Times* (April 23, 2020): 27. Also see "Bucking the trend," *The Economist* (April 2020): 58.

[50]Carney, "Putting Values above Valuations," 64.

https://publications.lst.edu/

4. *Climate Financing as Actionizing Alterity.* God's Cocreative Spirit is the power behind the mobilization of funds at the Glasgow COP 26, symbolizing the eruption of the ethics of alterity in the collective conscience of the wealthy nations in response to the plight of the vulnerable nations. An "alteritized conscience" impinges on the wealthy developed nations, responsible for 76% of global greenhouse gas emissions, to shoulder the mitigation-adaptation cost of the low-middle-income nations for their decarbonization efforts.[51] Moreover, climate finance has to consider the loss and damage cost of climate impacts caused by rising sea levels, extreme weather events, and droughts that affects them the most. The World Bank estimates the natural disaster cost at $18 billion a year with further costs to households and businesses totaling $390 a year in these countries. The UN Environmental Program calculates that the adaptation costs in developing countries to be $70 billion, and predict they will rise to anything from $140 billion to $300 billion by 2030 – an increase of at least 50%.[52] The United Nations forecast that vulnerable countries will need up to $300 billion per year by 2030 for climate adaptation alone, discounting the potential economic losses from crop failure or climate-related disasters. Hurricane Maria in 2017

[51]The G7 developed countries agreed in 2009 to contribute $100 billion a year in climate finance to poorer countries by 2020. But the target was not met, in part because of the Covid pandemic. Catherine Pettengell, director at Climate Action Network, told Reuters news agency: "We had hoped that the leaders of the world's richest nations would come away from this week having put their money their mouth is." Cf. "G7 summit: Leaders pledge climate action but disappoint activists," *BBC News*, June 13, 2021, https://www.bbc.com/news/world-57461670.

[52]Gareth Redmond-King, "Climate Finance and COP 26," https://eciu.net/analysis/briefings/cop26/the-glasgow-climate-summit-finance; Redmond-King, "G20 Meeting and Climate Pledges," https://eciu.net/analysis/briefings/international-perspectives/g20-meetings-climate-pledges.

https://publications.lst.edu/

cost the Caribbean $69.4 billion. Moreover, actionizing alterity through climate finance is crucial in bringing on board the 150 developing nations with just over 6.5 billion people. In Espinosa's advocacy, the Race To Zero emission is only tenable with them, for "to think we can address climate change without them; to think we can make the transition to a cleaner and greener future without them; to ultimately ensure the safety of humanity on this planet without them – is impossible."[53]

5. Strategic *Political Actions. Rûah Elohim* acts gently and mightily from within the courage and passion of the *"alteritized agency"* of the like of scholar-activist, Vandana Shiva, who advocates the need to engage in a plurality of political activities with the "small-scale, counter-cultural communities."[54] Michael Northcott believes that these communities are the source of "resistance to corporate power ...in the recovery of place, and that religious tradition is a potentially powerful source of such resistance."[55] These communities engage in political activities, ranging from the reconciliation of differences, building alliances of resistance against the centralized and structural violence of biopiracy of corporate globalization behind the covert patenting of seeds, water, mustard oil, oilseeds and biodiversity, to the industrialization of agriculture. The

[53]UN Climate Change Executive Secretary Patricia Espinosa has persistently made her appeal to the nations of G7 and G20 to honor the 2012 commitment to climate financing. See "UN Climate Chief Urges Countries to Deliver on USD 100 Billion Pledge," June 7, 2021, https://unfccc.int/news/un-climate-chief-urges-countries-to-deliver-on-usd-100-billion-pledge.

[54]Vandana Shiva, *Earth Democracy: Justice, Sustainability and Peace* (London: Zed Books, 2016).

[55]Michael Northcott, *Place, Ecology and the Scared* (London: Bloomsbury Publishing, 2015 [Kindle Edition]), location 379. Also see Gerard Whelan SJ "Integral Ecology and Interdisciplinary Collaboration: Michael Northcott and Michael Northcott, Bernard Lonergan in Dialogue," *The Heythrop Journal: A Bimonthly Review of Philosophy and Theology* (November 6, 2018): 934.

https://publications.lst.edu/

awakened subjects also engage in building networks of local communities, connected with the global spheres of political influences for a sustainable livelihood and flourishing future for the grassroot communities, the biodiversity and ecosystems within the earth community.[56] For reasons of the climate adversities that affect the grassroots communities the most, these grassroots networks need to collaborate with global campaigns such as "Race To Zero," which involve a "coalition of leading net zero initiatives, representing 733 cities, 31 regions, 3,067 businesses, 173 of the biggest investors, and 622 Higher Education Institutions."[57] These are "real economy" actors who join 120 countries, committed to achieving net zero carbon emissions by 2050, which "now cover nearly 25% global CO2 emissions and over 50% GDP."[58]

Conclusion

In envisioning a PPC world, a reimagined Levinasian ethics of alterity with a pneumatic orientation, grounded in a corporeal pneumatology, offers a pertinent and timely critique of a Western subjectivity that is mired in a self-indulgent life, turning inward instead of the welcoming embrace of the vulnerable other and the violated Earth. Only this kenotic encounter enables *Rûah Elohim* to liberate the enchained self and the developed nations, and subsequently motivate both to embrace the nudity of the vulnerability of fellow humans and the low-middle-income nations.

The exercise of a Spirit-driven alterity has allowed *Rûah Elohim* to awaken in humankind a discernible, albeit gradual realization, that "everything in this world is related" (LS §91)

[56]Shiva, *Earth Democracy*.

[57]UN Climate Change Climate Action, "Race to Zero," https://unfccc.int/climate-action/race-to-zero-campaign.

[58]Ibid.

and "genuine care for our own lives and our relationships with nature is inseparable from fraternity, justice, and faithfulness to others" (LS §70).[59] Co-arising from the rubble of this pandemic and the climate-stricken world is a reimagined existence: "I relate within the we-earth-cosmos," therefore "we-are-with-in-Earth-Cosmos," beyond Bird-David's "I relate, therefore I am" and Descartes's "I think, therefore I am" that Sigurd Bergmann posits.[60]

Such an emanation signifies the corporeal co-creativity of *Rûah Elohim* in the discernible glocal shifts in the world whence awakened subjects actionize/visibilize alterity in response to the cries of the vulnerable humans, nations, and wounded earth. Through the pneumatically *"alteritized"* subjects, institutions, and networks, *Rûah Elohim* is emanating an emergent PPC world that signifies the inbreaking of a New Creation, a New Earth with a New Heaven from the residues of a currently ruptured world.

[59]LS is the abbreviation of *Laudato Si'*, Pope Francis' Second Encyclical Letter. Cf. Francis, *Laudato Si: On Care For Our Common Home*, Encyclicals, May 24, 2015, https://www.vatican.va/content/francesco/en/encyclicals/documents/papa-francesco_20150524_enciclica-laudato-si.html.

[60]Sigurd Bergmann, "Millions of Machines are Already Roaring': Fetished Technology Encountered by the Life-Giving Spirit," in *Technofutures, Nature And The Sacred*, edited by Celia Deane-Drummon, Sigurd Bergmann and Bronislaw Szerszynski (Surrey, UK & Burlington, VT, USA: 2015), 115-137, at 132;. Burit Bird-David, "Animism" Revisited: Personhood, Environment and Relational Epistemology', *Current Anthropology* 40, no. 1 (1999): 69-91; Alf Hornborg, 'Submitting to Objects: Animism, Fetishism and the Cultural Foundations of Capitalism', in *Handbook of Animism,* Graham Harvey, ed., (London: Acumen 2014), 244-59.

https://publications.lst.edu/